

## Minutes of the ISCARSAH meeting in Istanbul, July 11 – 13, 2001

Report made by K. Van Balen

### Proposed agenda:

Tuesday July 10:

Arrivals

Wednesday July 11:

9:00 – 11:00: planning activities, analysis of documents of the committee,  
state of the art

11:00 – 16:00: technical visit in small group

16:00 – 19:00: organisation of documents

Thursday July 12:

ISCARSAH internal meeting (beside the SAS2001 conference) on recommendations and annexes during the whole day;

Friday July 13:

Morning: technical visit to Church of Saints Sergius and Bachus, discussion on possible collaboration and study supporting research carried out by Prof. OZSEN, planning further activities

(Prof. G. Croci has to leave in the afternoon)

Other members continue making a synthetic report on the need for research and guidance on structural consolidation of the former Sergius and Bachus church.

(Participation to closing session of SAS2001)

Closure of ISCARSAH meeting

Saturday July 14

Free visits

Sunday July 15

Departure

### Actual agenda and report

Tuesday July 10:

Arrivals

Wednesday July 11:

9:00 – 16:00: technical visit in two groups

16:00 – 19:00: organisation of documents and planning of report:

present: G. Croci, K. Van Balen, David Yeomans, Androniki Miltiadou, Yaacov Schaeffer, Nikos Charkiolakis, Juhani Penttiniemi, Ramiro Sofronie, Gorün Arun, Predrag Gavrilovic,

It was decided to concentrate the work and the activity report of the committees meeting on the following 4 parts:

Part 1: General approach and methodology for the analysis and diagnosis and repair of historic structures in Istanbul and similar area's (earthquake prone regions, certain typologies, ...).

Part 2: Structural problems and intervention criteria in brick and stone masonry buildings.

Part 3: Case study the Küçük AyaSofia Camesi and its emergency stabilization.

Part 4: ISCARSAH suggestion for training efforts towards engineers and contractors.

Later on while preparing the report, the 4 mentioned parts have been grouped to the results of the work of 2 subgroups, one on training and one on Adapted and local guidelines. All together a statement was developed on the Küçük AyaSofia Camesi Emergency Stabilization which corresponds with part 3.

Thursday July 12:

ISCARSAH internal meeting ;

present: G. Croci (OM), David Yeomans (OM), Steve Kelley (OM), Kenichiro Hidaka (OM), Yaacov Schaeffer (OM), Fritz Wenzel (M), Luigia Binda (AM), Androniki Miltiadou (M), Nikos Charkiolakis (AM), Juhani Penttimikko (M), Ramiro Sofronie (M), Gorün Arun (M), K. Van Balen (OM) (rapporteur).

(OM): officer-member

(M): member

(AM): associate member

Board meeting:

Officers present: G. Croci (OM), David Yeomans (OM), Steve Kelley (OM), Kenichiro Hidaka (OM), Yaacov Schaeffer (OM), Gorün Arun (OM), K. Van Balen (OM) (rapporteur).  
Apologises: W. Schmidt (OM)

Observers: Fritz Wenzel (M), Luigia Binda (AM), Androniki Miltiadou (M), Nikos Charkiolakis (AM), Juhani Penttimikko (M), Ramiro Sofronie (M)

Management matters:

1. The president thanks Prof. G. ARUN for her help in organizing this meeting and congratulates her with the success of the Symposium.
2. The Secretary-General is requested to check the list of the members and to ask all members to give an E-mail address where they can be contacted. It has been decided that unless motivated exception all communication from the secretariat should be carried out through E-mail. All members will be asked to reconfirm their membership to the committee, which requires an active participation to the activities of the committee. They are also requested to check with their national ICOMOS committee their position as representative member of their country.
3. 3 persons (**Homayoun Arbabian** from IRAN, **Pere Roca** from Spain, **Predrag Gavrilovic** from Macedonia) have submitted a request to become member of the committee. The meeting accepts their candidature and request them to contact their national ICOMOS committee to be proposed as member or associate member. The president states that as the national committee of Iran is not functioning the associate membership of Homayoun Arbabian can be accepted as such. The 3 new members are requested to send in a CV to the secretariat stressing their experience in the field covered by the activities of ISCARSAH.
4. There has been an exchange of communication with Paulo Lourenco from Portugal to join to the III Seminar on Historical Constructions in Guimaraes next November a meeting of the committee. Recent exchanges of information have shown that no financial support will be available while the location of the meeting place is rather difficult to reach at low budget. It is therefor suggested to have the next meeting within the margin of the:

UNESCO-ICOMOS International Congress

**"More than two thousand years in the history of architecture"**

(Paris 10-12 September 2001).

Information will be send around to the members within the shortest delay to inform them on the modification of the planned working programme. The arguments for the change are the more easy accessibility an low budget of Paris, the likeliness that more members will be present at that event. The meeting was to be arranged on 8 and 9 September 2001, before the UNESCO Congress.

***VERY important notice: Exchange of information between the President, the Secretary-General and Arch. Schmuckle-Mollard after the ISCARSAH meeting has revealed that it will be very difficult to arrange the meetings in the week-end before the congress, therefor the President has decided to have the meeting on September 13, 14 and 15 in the morning. (The Secretary-General will not be present on September 13 due to other obligations but this should not hinder to have the meeting on those dates)***

5. There a number of tentative proposals about the meetings after the Paris meeting. They will be discussed in Paris as more information will be available. The President announces that he could benefit from a grant of the National Research Council in Italy for a meeting that could take place for example in Athens or Israel; Arch. Schmuckle Mollard informs that a meeting is being prepared dealing with regulation, standardisation in November 2002 and one on reuse of religious buildings in February 2003; in October 2002 there will be the General Assembly of Icomos in Zimbabwe.
6. Predrag Gavrilovic (NAM), Pere Roca (NAM) are joining officially the meeting as new members (see supra)
7. The president distributes a new version of the recommendations. It should be carefully read so that at the meeting in Paris the document could be closed temporarily and be used to be referred to

when more precise recommendations related to certain regions or types of structures are to be developed. Detailed comments of the members present at the meeting should be sent to the President and the Secretary General.

8. Further see following Report of work carried out by the committee at the Istanbul meeting.

Friday July 13:

Morning: technical visit to Church of Saints Sergius and Bachus, discussion on possible collaboration and study supporting research carried out by Prof. OZSEN, planning further activities

(Prof. G. Croci has to leave in the afternoon)

Other members continue making a synthetic report on the need for research and guidance on structural consolidation of Küçük AyaSofia Camesi and finish report preparation.

(Participation to closing session of SAS2001)

Closure of ISCARSAH meeting

Saturday July 14

Free visits

Sunday July 15

Departure

## ISCARSAH ISTANBUL 2001 REPORT

Part 1: General approach and methodology for the analysis and diagnosis and repair of historic structures in Istanbul and similar area's (earthquake prone regions, certain typologies, ...).

Part 2: Structural problems and intervention criteria in brick and stone masonry buildings.

Contributed: Christiane Schmuckle-Mollard, Nikolas Charkiolakis, Predrag Gavrilovic, Pere Roca, Androniki Miltiadou-Fezans, Kenichiro Hidaka, Gorün Arun, Giorgio Croci, Stephen Kelley (rapporteur)

*(to be completed with information from S. Kelley, will be send later)*

### Part 3: Case study the Küçük AyaSofia Camesi and its emergency stabilization.

To whom it may concern,

We the undersigned members of the ISCARSAH Committee visited the Küçük AyaSofia Camesi in Istanbul, Turkey on 13 July 2001 and made a cursory examination of the condition of the structure.

The existing vertical cracks on the northeast and southeast corners through the dome as evidenced on the interior plaster surfaces have increased in width since the earthquake of 1999. This suggests that cracks through the masonry behind may have also increased. Therefore there is a danger of partial collapse, especially during future seismic activities. Other damages may exist that are not easily discernible that also contribute to this safety concern.

Therefore some temporary restraint needs to be provided as a matter of urgency. This would entail temporary tension devices be installed on the exterior of the structure beneath the dome; and scaffolding provided on the interior to protect visitors, perform close up inspections, and shore areas of the dome as necessary to prevent partial collapse.

However there is insufficient information at present to design any permanent strengthening measures. We recommend that no further work be undertaken until full examination of the structure has been carried out to enable these measures to be properly designed.

It is also the view of the Committee that the present condition of this significant structure suggests that it to be placed on the ICOMOS list of Heritage at Risk.

Sincerely,

Nikolas Charkiolakis (Greece)  
Giorgio Croci (Italy)  
Predrag Gavrilovič (Macedonia)  
Kenichiro Hidaka (Japan)  
Stephen J. Kelley (USA)  
Androniki Miltiadou-Fezans (Greece)  
Juhani Pentinmekko (Finland)  
Ya'acov Schaffer (Israel)  
Christian Schmuckle-Mollard (France)  
Ramiro Sofronie (Romania)  
Koenraad van Balen (Belgium)  
David Yeomans (UK)

## Part 4: ISCARSAH suggestion for training efforts towards engineers and contractors.

Contributed: Gorün Arun, Juhani Pentinmekko, Ya'acov Schaffer, Ramiro Sofronie, Fritz Wenzel, David Yeomans, Koenraad Van Balen (rapporteur)

A group of International experts on Analysis and Restoration of Structures of Architectural Heritage have visited various sites of the architectural heritage during their meeting in Istanbul from July 11 till July 13, 2001

After those visits and the discussions held during the meeting, the experts of ISCARSAH recommend:

Considered that a problem that is evidences at various places worldwide on a proper approach of the analysis and restoration of structures of architectural heritage;

Taking into account the Principles and Recommendations the ISCARSAH committee has developed and is developing since a few years on the Analysis and conservation and structural restoration of the architectural heritage;

Considering the efforts professionals and authorities are devoting to conserve the heritage in Istanbul; Considering the need for more precise guidelines on the best practice for structural restoration of historic buildings;

The experts gathered advice that training activities should be set-up to accelerate the transfer of the international available knowledge on this topic with the aim to:

- Over-bridge the existing gap between the field of architectural heritage and engineering knowledge, training and practices;
- Over-bridge the gap between appropriate knowledge on structural engineering in historic structures and the existing practice based on appropriate and adapted technologies and contracting works;
- To prepare the engineers, contractors and professionals to use more adapted intervention and remedial measures in case of the event of an earthquake;
- To bring the structural repair approach to the field of application, to promote insight and to promote engineers to take up their responsibility in the safeguard of the heritage.

A first course could be set-up and given in Turkish having an adapted level of understanding. Such a course could include the following items:

1. Theory of Conservation (2\*4h)
  - Understanding of values of historic buildings and the layered concept of authenticity;
  - History of Conservation;
  - Charters of conservation;
  - Legislation an international and national level.
2. Building Technology (6\*4h)
  - Materials used in history and construction techniques;
  - Binders, masonry with and without mortar;
  - Timber
  - Vaults, arches, cupolas
  - (Traditional and modern) Statical systems and structural understanding.
3. Research and Analysis (4\*4h)
  - Survey and documentation techniques;
  - Modeling of structures
  - Maintenance monitoring and interventions;
  - Investigation and analytical techniques.
4. Case studies (8\*4h)
  - International examples including wrong and good examples;
  - Global approach and management of restoration and conservation projects.

Istanbul, July 13, 2001

List of participants with updated information

**Members of  
ICOMOS International Scientific Committee for Analysis and Restoration of Structures of Architectural Heritage  
abbreviated ISCARSAH**

*Present at the ISTANBUL meeting 11-13/07/2001*

First Name	Name	title	position	country	organisation	adresse	zip-code	City	telephone	fax	E-mail
Gorun	ARUN (OSZEN)	Dr.	officer/ member	Turkey	Yildiz Technical University, Faculty of Architecture	Mimarlik Fakultesi	TR-80750	Yildiz-Istanbul-Turkey	-212-2597070/2743	-212-2610549	gozsen@yildiz.edu.tr
Luigia	BINDA	Prof.	ass. Member	Italy	Politecnico di Milano	Piazza Leonardo da Vinci, 32	I-20133	Milano	-2-23994318	-2-23994220	binda@rachele.stru.polimi.it
Nikos	CHARKIOLAKIS	arch.	ass. Member	Greece	Ministry of Culture	82, Fokionos Negri Str.	GR-11361	Athens	+30-1-8813345	+30-1-8813345	
Giorgio	CROCI	Prof.	officer/ member	Italy		Via Fonte di Fauno 2a	I-00153	Rome	06-5746335	06-5781268	mc3832@mclink.it
Predrag	GAVRILOVIC	Professor	new member	Republic of Macedonia	Institute of Earthquake Engineering and Engineering Seismology	P.O. Box 101		91000 Skopje	+389 (02) 176-155	+389 (02) 112-163	Predrag@pluto.iziis.ukim.edu.mk
Kenichiro	HIDAKA	Prof.	officer/ member	Japan	University of Tsukuba; Inst. Art & Design	Tennoh-dai	305-8574	Tsukuba	-298-53-6344	-298-53-6508	akadih@geijutsu.tsukuba.ac.jp
Stephen	KELLEY	Sr. Consultant	officer/ member	USA	Wiss Janney Elstner Assoc.	120 N. Lasalle Street, Suite 2000	IL 60602	Chicago	-312-372-0555	-312-372-0873	sjk@wje.com
Androniki	MILTADOU	dr.eng.	member	Greece	Ministère de la Culture	Myraktis 2-4	GR-17121	Nea Smyrni	-1-9355282	1-3250448	amiltiadou@tee.gr
Juhani	PENTINMIKKO	engineer	member	Finland	Pentinmikko Consulting Engineers	kanervatie 29	FIN-00730	Helsinki	358-9-3506363	358-9-3506303	juhani.pentinmikko@pentinmikko.com
Pere	ROCA		new member	Spain	Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya	Jordi Girona 1-3, mod C1	08034	Barcelona	+34-93-4017381	+34-93-4011036	pedro.roca@upc.es
Yaacov	SCHAFFER	Director	officer/ member	Israel	Israel Antiquity Authority	P.O. Box 586	ISR-91004	Jerusalem	-2-6204701	-2-6260105	yaacov@israntique@org.il
Christian	SCHMUCKLE	Arch.	officer/ member	France		19, Rue Ampère	F-75017	Paris	1-45448182	1-45441379	csmollar@club-internet.fr
Ramiro	SOFRONIE		assoc. member	Romania	Univ. of Bucharest	Bd. Marasti 59	71331	Bucharest	+401-2242149	+401-2242149	ecoland@ecoland.ro
Koenraad	VAN BALEN	Prof.	officer/ member	Belgium	K.U.Leuven Civ. Eng. & RLCC	Kasteelpark Arenberg 40	B-3001	Leuven	016-321172	016-321976	Koenraad.VanBalén@bwk.kuleuven.ac.be
Fritz	WENZEL	Prof.	member	Germany	Universität Karlsruhe, SFB 315	Englerstrasse 7	D-76128	Karlsruhe	-721-6082183	-721-358146	



David YEOMANS Prof. officer/ U.K. Manchester School Oxford Rd UK - M13 Manchester -161 275 -161 275 david@yeomans.u-net.com  
member of Architecture 9 PL 6920 6935

Contact address of new members:

Roca: see supra

Gavrilovic: see supra

Homayoun ARBABIAN, [h\\_arbaban@hotmail.com](mailto:h_arbaban@hotmail.com)